## Sasha Linker

From: Al Dugan <aldugan2002@yahoo.com>
Sent: Thursday, January 11, 2018 4:45 PM

To: CommAsst

**Subject:** Lucan (FPPC Case No. 16/284)

I will be unable to make Mr. Lucan's attempt to change his finding by the FPPC, but I wanted to provide comments.

Mr. Lucan bought his duplex in 2014, a four minute walk from his proposed Novato downtown SMART station for which he was the primary advocate. Lucan began advocating for the downtown SMART station in 2015. Lucan also voted on the first funding of this project in October 6, 2015. I do not belief he checked with the FPPC about the need to recuse himself from voting at that time. See the below link to the city council meeting, General Business item 9.

## http://novato.org/home/showdocument?id=14727

Mr. Lucan's last minute attempt to contact the FPPC before the January 2016 vote is well after his vote in October 2015.

In January 2016 Lucan rushed thru this project, despite the staff recommending it not to build. <a href="http://cms6ftp.visioninternet.com/novato/agendas/pdfstaffreports/cc012616\_I-5.pdf">http://cms6ftp.visioninternet.com/novato/agendas/pdfstaffreports/cc012616\_I-5.pdf</a> Lucan told other council members SMART train service would begin a few months after January 2016 and building a station later would cost more. Mr. Lucan was on the SMART board, and certainly should have been aware this schedule was not accurate. Myself and others knew the complex Positive Train Control would never be ready in his stated time frame. For the record the the SMART train service took over a year from January 2016 to actual beginning operation.

I have included an email string between Mr. Lucan in myself where it confirms he was working on this project in October of 2015, besides his on the record vote at the October 6, 2015 city council meeting.

Al Dugan

Concerned Novato Citizen.

From: Eric Lucan <<u>elucan@novato.org</u>>
Date: September 4, 2017 at 8:35:12 PM PDT
To: Al Dugan <<u>aldugan2002@yahoo.com</u>>
Subject: Re: Novato Downtown SMART Stop

A1-

Thought we had covered this at the forum. The city council commissioned the study regarding the feasability of alternating stops between Atherton and Downtown back in 2015. The results of that study were provided to the city council. On January 12, 2016, we had a workshop on the matter. <a href="http://cms6ftp.visioninternet.com/novato/agendas/pdfstaffreports/cc011216">http://cms6ftp.visioninternet.com/novato/agendas/pdfstaffreports/cc011216</a> L-11.pdf

Eric Lucan Councilmember City of Novato 415-272-3265

On Tue, Aug 29, 2017 at 10:45 PM, Al Dugan <a href="mailto:aldugan2002@yahoo.com">aldugan2002@yahoo.com</a>> wrote:

Eric, following up. We touched base at the Novato city council forum and you confirmed you would get back.

Best, Al Dugan

Sent from my iPad

On Aug 21, 2017, at 9:15 AM, Al Dugan <aldugan2002@yahoo.com> wrote:

Eric, I have a few questions that simply require yes or no for your convenience.

- 1. As the TAM representative for the SMART board, did you advise or brief the Novato city council members of the significant additional work and expense, besides the actual stop cost, to allow the Novato downtown SMART station to become a full service train stop?
- 2. I note the agreement between SMART and the City of Novato required Novato to pay all cost relative to the Novato downtown SMART stop. Does this also mean the City of Novato would also have to pay all expense and cost for additional track, and additional train and reengineering of the SMART system to become a stop receiving full train service?

Best regards, Al Dugan Novato

Sent from my iPad



Subject: Novato Downtown SMART Stop

I have attached the staff report for a board meeting of SMART in April 6, 2016. Attached to the SMART staff report is an LTK engineering report date January 4, 2016 created well before the January 26, 2016 approval of Phase 1 by the Novato city council. This LTK report on page 3 details the significant additional investments in tracks and trains required for the Novato downtown SMART station to function as a full time station. (See page 3 of the LTK 1/4/2016 report.) This would apparently require millions more of additional dollars over the cost of the actual stop being currently primarily paid for by the city of Novato. This LTK Engineering report was buried on page 23 of the 71 page Novato staff report for the January 26, 2016 meeting to vote on the proposed Novato downtown SMART project. The important additional cost detailed on page 3 of the LTK report, besides the actual stop costs, were not mentioned or discussed in the Novato city staff report in the sections titled "Feasibility Study Results", "SMART Parameters" or "Conclusions". This was also not discussed in the City council meeting for consideration of Phase 2.

The probable additional significant cost to allow the Novato Downtown SMART Stop to be a full service stop should have been clearly disclosed to citizens and part of the discussion for both the vote for Phase 1 as well as Phase 2.

Sincerely, Al Dugan Novato

<08\_Downtown Novato Station Staff Report.pdf>

Sent from my iPad